Director of the Company and alongside Baillie was a founding member of the Royal Asiatic Society.

The author argues that these figures were part of a class and generation of Scots who played fundamental roles in a period of militarization of the East India Company from the 1780s to 1820s. Although some concern for Indian mothers and the impact of British rule is expressed, this book conforms to the popular canon which focuses on the intrepid and improving Scots of empire. Given the well-known obstacles that scholars from marginalized communities in the West and those of the Global South endure in order to secure publication, it is disappointing that the publisher selected this unscholarly book, despite its use of rich archival sources, for inclusion in its academic category.

It may be unfair to judge *Scotland and the Indian Empire* and *India in Edinburgh* by the standards of decolonial scholars such as Gopal. Gust's *Unhomely Empire* does this decolonial work by showing how cultural comparison and colonial rule served to create, as Gopal argues, the West as distinct and superior. By taking a critical and interrogative approach to *Scotland and the Indian Empire* and *India in Edinburgh,* a reckoning with empire, as Gopal argues, can be "reparative of the European itself" (p. 2). *India in Edinburgh,* in particular, makes strides in the direction of highlighting the knowledge that came from India through Scottish sojourning. Another step would be to re-link the disavowed learning from colonized and subjugated peoples in order to show a wider perspective on knowledge production in the long eighteenth century.

Burns and Song: Four New Publications
By Karen E. McAulay, Royal Conservatoire of Scotland

Ian Brown and Gerard Carruthers, ed., ***Performing Robert Burns: Enactments and Representations of the "National Bard"***. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2021. Pp. vi + 210.

Katherine Campbell and Emily Lyle, ***Robert Burns and the Discovery and Re-Creation of Scottish Song***. Musica Scotica Historical Studies of Scottish Music Volume 4. Glasgow: Musica Scotica Trust, 2020. Pp. xi + 233.

Morag J. Grant, ***Auld Lang Syne: A Song and Its Culture***. Cambridge: Open Book Publishers, 2021. Pp. xvii + 335. E-book: https://books.openbookpublishers.com/10.11647/obp.0231.pdf

The Oxford Edition of the Works of Robert Burns, Volume 4: Robert Burns's Songs for George Thomson. Edited by Kirsteen McCue. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021. Pp. xcvi + 692.

For four significant scholarly works about one Scottish poet's relationship to song to be published in the space of two years is, perhaps, unprecedented. However, it is less surprising when one considers that the subject is Scotland's national poet, Robert Burns, and that there have recently been large British AHRC-funded research initiatives into his work. Despite the obvious overlap in subject matter, each of these four volumes offers a completely different angle on Burns's songs. The book with the broadest scope is Ian Brown and Gerard Carruthers's edited essay collection, *Performing Robert Burns.* Fifteen contributors, including the editors, provide thirteen essays. The topics are wide-ranging, discussing performance and print (Ian Brown and Gerard Carruthers; John Burnett and Gerard Carruthers); Burns in the theatre and music hall (Jim Davis with Tracy Cattell; Paul Maloney); Burns's songs in the context of Burns Suppers (Ronnie Young); "Tam o' Shanter" on stage (Paul Maloney and Adrienne Scullion); Burns in public ceremonial (Christopher A. Whatley); Burns's works on stage in the twentieth century (Rhona Brown); Burns represented in film (Alistair Braidwood); Burns on concert platforms from the late nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century (Kirsteen McCue); Burns as national bard in the folk context (Katherine Campbell); Burns's songs in Jean Redpath's archive (Moira Hansen); and finally "Performing the Work of Robert Burns" (Sheena Wellington). While scholarly readers are likely to be drawn initially to particular chapters addressing their own interests, the collection as a whole offers many useful insights into other aspects of Burns's impact on subsequent Scottish culture. The volume therefore represents a convenient way to become acquainted with recent scholarship on topics that might be peripheral to one's own main focus but nonetheless provide helpful additional background.

At the opposite end of the spectrum, Morag Grant's book looks at the impact of just one song. Yet it treats that song, "Auld Lang Syne," in the widest possible context, discussing social practice, the customs around the performance of the song, and song research from the late eighteenth to the early twentieth century—in other words, both its origins and its subsequent history. Grant also addresses the song's reception in Germany and elsewhere and considers its significance in terms of personal or group identity, such as its importance to emigrants or in freemasonry. The introduction informs us that the monograph is "not directed only, perhaps not even primarily, at musicologists" (p. xiii). Grant's five appendices are followed by an impressive bibliography, a list of illustrations, and audio examples. Through the miracle that is open access, all 360 pages of text are available online at no cost.

Katherine Campbell and Emily Lyle's *Robert Burns and the Discovery and Re-Creation of Scottish Song*

falls somewhere between the Brown/Carruthers and Grant books in its range of coverage. Since the authors have backgrounds and expertise in Scottish ethnography and ethnomusicology, their statement in the preface about concentrating "on the songs alone" makes sense, following the approach used by James Dick and Donald A. Low in their respective editions of *The Songs of Robert Burns* (1903 and 1993) and Caterina Ericson-Roos's *The Songs of Robert Burns: A Study of the Unity of Poetry and Music* (1977). Murray Pittock's new edition of the *Scots Musical Museum* appeared after the present book had been submitted for publication, and Campbell and Lyle have consequently made a few additions and revisions, as acknowledged in their notes. The writings of Kirsteen McCue are also referenced, and they note her edition of Thomson's Burns songs as forthcoming. Such overlaps or hiccups in timing are inevitable when several books on the same topic are published within a couple of years of each other.

Campbell and Lyle set out to place the songs of Burns in the context of the cultural environment both before and after his work, and also in the context of oral tradition. In ten chapters, including an introduction, the authors examine a small number of songs in detail, considering words or tunes that existed beforehand, or beyond Burns's immediate orbit, with or without the same lyrics. In other instances, Burns might have developed his song on, for example, just the opening line, or perhaps by taking some lines of an earlier song as a repeating chorus rather than as part of a continuous series of verses. These are detailed essays paying close attention to particular topics, such as a letter written by Burns to William Tytler; the inspiration derived from Burns's journey with a friend to northern Scotland (as far as Loch Ness) in August and September 1787; Burns's experiences of, and references to, psalm singing, and his psalm paraphrases; and Burns's bawdy songs and the alterations that were necessary to make them acceptable for either James Johnson's *Scots Musical Museum* or George Thomson's more up-market Scottish song anthologies. Burns's informants are investigated, with particularly close attention to the childhood influence of his mother and the recollections of his youngest sister, Isabella Begg, but also noting their wide variety. Mention is also made of Burns's highly retentive memory and his musicality. It is commonly known that Isabella alluded to his violin playing as being adequate to amuse himself, but we note also that Burns himself wrote in an entry dated September 1785 that he had devised a tune in "the old Scotch style" for "O raging Fortune's Withering Blast" but was "not Musical Scholar enough to prick down my tune properly, so it can never see the light" (p. 40). From this one infers that although he could read music well enough to play a tune, Burns wasn't completely conversant with the theory and musical "grammar" behind writing it down.

Chapter 7 reappraises the work on the *Scots Musical Museum* of the English music arranger Stephen Clarke and examines evidence in surviving records about his life and work in Edinburgh. One forms the impression that Clarke was capable but considered lazy. Nonetheless, a whole chapter about his work with Burns's songs is very welcome, as he often flits in and out of writings about Burns but is seldom the main focus. The final chapter is not a conclusion as such, but it does finish with a reiteration of Burns's creativity and working practices, alluding to his close collaborative relationships with Johnson and Thomson. The authors' aims are summarized in the final sentence in the chapter: "*The present book has aimed to give detailed coverage to a limited cross-section of Burns's songs and their contexts in a way that it is hoped helps to bring us close to Burns's work of creation" (p. 212).* After so much detailed detective work and examination of songs, airs and sources, the closing words are absolutely accurate, but it does seem a rather abrupt close to such a scholarly book.

The book has all the usual apparatus of preface, acknowledgements, lists of figures, examples and abbreviations at the beginning, and a bibliography, along with indices of people, songs, poems, and tunes at the end. It is also very generously provided with musical examples (words and melodies, but not basslines or accompaniments, which are not needed in the present context). The examples were produced using a common music-writing software program, Finale. If there is a minor criticism—with apologies to non-music readers—there are a few missing dots and quaver rests, and the "pick-up" (anacrusis) function at the start of pieces has not always been deployed properly, with spacing looking a little irregular in places. These are, however, very minor defects. There is much detailed scholarship in the volume, which certainly adds favorably to recent writings on Burns's song writing.

Of the four books reviewed here, *Robert Burns's Songs for George Thomson*, edited by Kirsteen McCue, is the largest and most important. It is the fourth volume in the *Oxford Edition of the Works of Robert Burns*, following volume 1, *Commonplace Books, Tour Journals, and Miscellaneous Prose*, edited by Nigel Leask (2014), and volumes 2–3, Murray Pittock's edition of the *Scots Musical Museum* (2018). In this volume McCue reproduces in facsimile more than 170 published songs for which the lyrics were written by Robert Burns for George Thomson's Scottish, Irish, and Welsh music collections, with exhaustive notes on their correspondence about each song. The facsimiles themselves occupy 352 pages and the notes another 300, followed by two appendices: a "Glossary of Scottish Words" (Thomson's own, from *A Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs* of 1805) and the "Alphabetical List of Song Texts within the Morgan Dalhousie MS (Correspondence from Robert Burns to George Thomson) Not Printed in Thomson's Collections."

McCue's extensive introduction falls into several distinct sections. First comes a "Note on the Text," which is crucial reading if one is to understand precisely what the volume contains, and its significance. Thanks to the correspondence between poet and publisher, Burns's role in Thomson's editions is far clearer than his role in Johnson's *Scots Musical Museum.* The reader does, however, need to remember that the present volume contains all the songs that Burns wrote for Thomson but does not contain all the songs published by Thomson that Burns was *not* responsible for. There is no point, for example, in looking for Beethoven's "Sir Johnie Cope," since it was

not one of Burns's songs. Note also that all the songs are newly numbered, and that diplomatic (i.e., literal) transcriptions have been made of manuscripts and early printed sources. Next comes an introduction to Burns's songs for Thomson, which provides the context for Thomson's publications, with a biography of Thomson and outlines the scope of his ambitions for these collections: what he wanted to achieve and the continental arrangers with whom he chose to work.

The next section of the introduction is a detailed exposition of "Burns and Thomson: The Correspondence." Thomson was Burns's most regular correspondent in Burns's later life, and McCue remarks that this is particularly significant given that Burns is known to have experienced episodes of hypomania when he was especially active in his creative endeavors. Although Burns's letters survive, the manuscripts of Thomson's letters to Burns have not been seen since Dr. James Currie published his four-volume *Works of Robert Burns* in 1800, and we are reminded that Currie's edition had some changes to the letters from Burns to Thomson. Thomson prepared the texts for publication, perhaps trying to put himself in a better light, particularly with respect to the question of remuneration. Burns had initially said that he did not wish to be paid and would be offended by further mention of the matter. However, in the years after his death, friends and editors made much of a letter that Burns wrote during his final illness, which revealed to Thomson the dire straits in which he found himself—things were so desperate that he was not too proud to ask for assistance. Thomson was subsequently criticized for not having helped Burns more. The letters also reveal how Burns viewed the song culture of the time: his views on the simplicity or complexity of particular songs, on the propriety of the words, the quality of the texts, his own musical preferences and his musical understanding of the songs he was setting. Additionally, as has been highlighted in McCue's earlier work, Burns had quite strong views about using English texts with more standardized English rather than Scots, although Thomson was clearly looking to his market south of the border in trying to make some of the songs more accessible.

A section of the introduction on "Thomson and the Currie Circle: Preparing the First Edition of the Poet's Life and Work (1796–1802)" examines Currie's edition as well as the reception of the Thomson volumes by scholars from the nineteenth century up to and including the recent activities by the Romantic National Song Network. The final section of the introduction addresses "The 'Intricate Bibliographical Enigma': Tracking Burns through Thomson's Select Collections." Readers unfamiliar with Thomson's collections may be unaware of the exceedingly complex interconnections and indeed variants between different copies of what, on the outside, appear to be identical titles. Reprints, new editions, and sections from different printers could all be intermingled in any particular copy. To the casual reader picking up such a copy and setting it on the piano stand, such details might appear of little significance. However, scholars of this particular genre find the bibliographical detail both intriguing and infuriating. McCue is to be congratulated for teasing out the intricacies and explaining them in a straightforward, comprehensible way.

Following the facsimiles of each song, the commentary section highlights contemporary aesthetic considerations such as the inclusion of English-language words, literary bigotry, or the wish to preserve pastoral simplicity. By being provided with this much detail, scholars have to hand a vast amount of detail with which to examine this collection in comparison with other contemporary anthologies; or to consider the significance of Thomson's collection on later collections. It is immeasurably useful to be able to consider observations by earlier scholars, in the context both of Burns and Thomson's own correspondence, and of subsequent scholarship. Take, for example, Thomson's observations about literary bigotry, vis à vis "Behind yon hills." Thomson writes to Burns that although it would be "unpardonable to sacrifice one good song in the Scottish dialect to make room for English verses," it would "be the very bigotry of literary patriotism" to omit "a few excellent ones suited to the unprovided or ill-provided airs…merely because the authors were born south of the Tweed" (p. 354). With the same song, our attention is drawn to Burns raising the important issue of pastoral simplicity, so often mentioned in contemporary commentary. Thomson's reply to Burns praises him for sending the revised verses of song in "rustic" guise, personifying the song thus: "On meeting with your *Nanie*, I had fallen violently in love with her. I thank you, therefore, for sending the charming rustic to me, in the dress in which you wish her to appear before the public" (p. 354). Reading these words brings to mind a passage in Joseph Ritson's *Scotish Song* (1794), where Ritson favorably compares Scottish with English songs, likening the former to "the beautiful peasant, in her homespun russet" and the latter to "the fine town lady…in all the frippery of fashion" (1:lxxix).

Similarly, McCue's volume sheds new light on issues which might have been differently interpreted in the years since Thomson's initial publications. For example, Dick's 1903 edition of *The Songs of Robert Burns* states that Thomson set "From thee, Eliza, I must go" (ST4 [T15]), to "a wrong tune" (p. 357). However, the present edition notes that Thomson chose not to use Burns's preferred tune (Thomson certainly used a different tune, but it is not here classified as "wrong"!), and suggests a possible source for the tune that Thomson did use—"Donald," in John Gunn's *Forty Favourite Scottish Airs* (published in 1789, only three years earlier than Burns and Thomson's initial correspondence about the song). We further learn that it appeared subsequent to Thomson's publication as "An Irish tune" in the *A Selection of Irish and Scots Tunes*, published by John Macpherson Mulhollan in 1804, apparently copied from Thomson. Moving from text and tunes to musical accompaniments, a similar level of detail allows us to read Thomson's discussions and editorial decisions about accompaniments, obbligato instruments, or—a persistent preoccupation—the complexity of the accompaniment. Thus, we can follow his instruction and

subsequent discussion with Henry Bishop, that Thomson wanted the closing "symphony" of each verse of "The Widow's Song' (from *The Jolly Beggars*) to be "adjusted to make it lighter for the violinist and pianist," citing British Library letters for each piece of correspondence (p. 583).

The work concludes with a bibliography that is divided into manuscripts, primary and secondary published sources up to c. 2019, and online resources. In the last of these categories, I would be remiss not to mention the website emanating from McCue and her team's AHRC-funded research, https://burnsc21.glasgow.ac.uk/, since it provides a wealth of material, audiovisual media, and more. Finally, there are indices of titles, first lines. and airs. These finding aids are essential in a book of this magnitude, all the more so, as McCue reminds us in the introduction, because there are inconsistencies between Burns's and Thomson's titles.

Scholarship on Burns and song has taken a giant step forward with these four volumes. This review has merely scratched the surface, and scholars are certain to benefit from the huge amount of collective work that these books contain.

Concluding the Reid Edition
by Aaron Garrett, Boston University

Paul Wood, ed., ***Thomas Reid and the University. With a New Transcription and English Translation of Thomas Reid's Philosophical Orations by Alexander Broadie.*** Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, and University Park, PA: Penn State University Press, 2021. The Edinburgh Edition of Thomas Reid, Volume 10. Pp. cxvi + 475.

The main body of *Thomas Reid and the University* concludes with two biographical accounts: Robert Cleghorn's brief "Sketch of the Character of the Late Thomas Reid," which appeared in 1796 as "Letter to the Editor" in the *Glasgow Courier*, and Dugald Stewart's far longer *Account of the Life and Writings of Thomas Reid* (1802). As Paul Wood—who has edited or co-edited four previous volumes in the *Edinburgh Edition of Thomas Reid*—notes in his extensive introduction to this book, Cleghorn and Stewart each knew Reid well, albeit in different capacities. Both admiringly describe a man who, in Cleghorn's words, "spoke of every thing like a superior being" (p. 181). Cleghorn's sketch does not avoid mention of Reid's political filiation with the French Revolution. Cleghorn notes that Reid "observed the great political events which have happened" (p. 181) and mentions Reid's potentially controversial moderate religious commitments and his belief that the 1688 Revolution was an act of divine providence. Stewart's *Account*, in contrast, cleanses Reid of controversy and presents a life of pure intellect: a philosopher's philosopher focused on the mind. Stewart's view dominated as the answer to the question "Who was Reid?" through the late twentieth century, and it still dominates what interest there is in his work among philosophers.

Having its substantial beginning with Knud Haakonssen's collection of Reid's lectures on natural jurisprudence and connected papers as *Practical Ethics* (initially published by Princeton University Press in 1990 but incorporated and modified in 2007 as vol. 6 in the *Reid Edition*: *Thomas Reid on Practical Ethics*), the individual volumes that make up the *Edinburgh Edition of Thomas Reid* have expanded readers' knowledge of who Reid was beyond the familiar tropes of David Hume's nemesis, or the philosopher's philosopher of mind, perception, and psychology, or the pillar of Common Sense. Haakonssen's *Practical Ethics* included Reid's "Some Thoughts on the Utopian System" (moved to *Thomas Reid on Society and Politics* in the *Reid Edition*), the complete manuscript of the measured but approving lecture on utopianism given at Glasgow College in 1794 against the background of the French Revolution and the Reign of Terror. Sections of the lecture were published in the *Glasgow Courier* with Cleghorn's *Sketch*. High among the many virtues of the *Reid Edition* is the access it gives us to the Reid who mostly disappeared after Stewart's *Account,* impartially and approvingly considering some of the principles of the French Revolution. This Reid was still very much present in Cleghorn's *Sketch*.

The *Reid Edition* includes excellent critical editions of *An Inquiry into the Human Mind* (edited by Derek Brookes, 1997), *Essays on the Intellectual Powers of Man* (edited by Derek Brookes and Knud Haakonssen, 2002), and *Essays on the Active Powers of Man* (edited by Knud Haakonssen and James Harris, 2010). But the greatest contribution of the edition to the intellectual history of the Scottish Enlightenment is in the less well-known materials, and in particular the manuscript materials—the import of which extends even beyond understanding Reid. This point holds true from the first volume in the edition, *Thomas Reid on the Animate Creation* (1995), which was also edited by Paul Wood. *Animate Creation* collects manuscript materials demonstrating Reid's serious first-hand engagement with the theories of matter and life sciences of his day. It is widely known that Reid was a gifted mathematician and had deep knowledge of Newton's mathematics and physics. It was less known prior to the appearance of *Animate Creation* that Reid's interests extended to life science—to Buffon, Roger Joseph Boscovich, and Charles Bonnet—and to the intersection of Newtonianism and biology in matter theory. These currents converge in Reid's notes on Joseph Priestley (and David Hartley) and in the unpublished, unfinished essay "Some Observations on the Modern System of Materialism" (*Animate Creation*, pp. 173–241). Priestley sent Reid a copy of his attack *An Examination of Dr. Reid's Inquiry into the Human Mind on the Principles of Common Sense*. Reid did not respond in print. His notes though, and Wood's introduction, make clear Reid's disagreements with Priestley on the latter's Newtonianism and on the natural scientific warrant in theories of matter for collapsing the distinction be-